

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of Fātimah, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of Fadak

The One in Need of Allah

Introduction:

Recently, there has been an increase in discussions regarding the story of the land of **Fadak**, with claimants asserting that it was the rightful inheritance of **Fātimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) from her father, the Prophet ﷺ. They have also harshly criticized the Companions of the Prophet ﷺ in this matter.

Fadak was a piece of land belonging to the Prophet ﷺ from the lands of **Khaybar**. It is well known that when the Prophet ﷺ arrived at **Khaybar** and besieged it, it was divided into two parts: one part was conquered by force, while the other was taken through a peace agreement (1). **Fadak** was among the lands that were obtained through a peace treaty in **Khaybar**, and it became the property of the Messenger of Allah ﷺ because it was among the lands that were

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

not conquered by cavalry or mounted forces. The Prophet ﷺ made a treaty with the Jews of **Fadak**, allowing them to cultivate the land while giving half of its produce to him.

After the Prophet ﷺ passed away, **Fātimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) came to claim her inheritance from her father. She went to **Abū Bakr**, the Caliph of the Muslims (may Allah be pleased with him), and requested that he grant her **Fadak** as her inheritance from the Prophet ﷺ. **Abū Bakr** replied:

"I heard the Messenger of Allah ﷺ say: We, the Prophets, do not leave behind inheritance; whatever we leave is charity." (2)

Although the disagreement between **Abū Bakr** and **Fātimah** (may Allah be pleased with them both) was a legitimate dispute between two parties, each possessing evidence for their stance, some people have been unfairly biased against **Abū Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him). They have claimed that **Abū Bakr** wronged **Fātimah**, denied her inheritance from her father ﷺ, and rejected the authenticity of the hadith:

"We, the Prophets, do not leave behind inheritance; whatever we leave is charity."

They sought to weaken this hadith by citing the Qur'anic verse:

{And Solomon inherited from David.} [Al-Naml: 16]

And the verse regarding **Zakariyyā** (peace be upon him), in which he says:

{He will inherit from me and inherit from the family of Jacob.} [Maryam: 6]

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

They argued that the hadith contradicts the **Qur'ānic** verses and that the verses should take precedence over the hadith. They also claimed that **Fātimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) became displeased with **Abū Bakr**, distanced herself from him due to what she perceived as injustice, and that some Companions allegedly harmed her and broke her rib because she objected to **Abū Bakr** on this matter. They allege that she did not speak to him until she passed away.

Furthermore, they criticize **Abū Bakr** by questioning: How could he believe **Jābir** (may Allah be pleased with him) in what he narrated but not believe **Fātimah** (may Allah be pleased with her)?!

They also claim that **Abū Bakr** angered **Fātimah**, and that he is thus included in the hadith of the Prophet ﷺ:

"Indeed, Fātimah is a part of me; whoever angers her has angered me." (3)

Refutation of These Claims:

By the help of Allah, we say: The reality of what happened is that **Fātimah** (peace be upon her) sent a request to **Abū Bakr**, asking for her inheritance from the Prophet ﷺ in what Allah had granted to His Messenger ﷺ. She asked for the charity of the Prophet ﷺ in **Madinah**, **Fadak**, and what remained from the spoils of **Khaybar**. **Abū Bakr** responded:

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of Fātimah, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of Fadak

"Indeed, the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said: **We do not leave behind inheritance; whatever we leave is charity.** The family of Muhammad only eats from this wealth. They are not entitled to take more than their provisions."

Then he said:

"By Allah, I will not change anything from the charities of the Prophet ﷺ that were in place during his time, and I will continue to handle them as the Messenger of Allah ﷺ did."

Then 'Alī bore witness, and he said:

"Indeed, we acknowledge your virtue, O Abū Bakr."

He then mentioned their relationship to the Messenger of Allah ﷺ and their rights. Abū Bakr responded:

"By the One in whose hand is my soul, the ties of kinship to the Messenger of Allah ﷺ are dearer to me than my own ties of kinship." (4)

This is the summary of what took place. Below is a detailed response to the claims made by the opponents:

First Point:

This disagreement arose due to an interpretation on the part of Fātimah (may Allah be pleased with her) and adherence to the explicit wording of the hadith by Abū Bakr (may Allah be pleased with him).

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of Fātimah, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of Fadak

Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) explained their differing interpretations, stating:

*"As for the reason for her anger, despite Abū Bakr's reliance on the hadith mentioned, it was not due to her rejecting the hadith but because she interpreted it differently from how Abū Bakr understood it. It is as if she believed that the general statement in the hadith: **We do not leave behind inheritance** was specific, and that the benefits of the land and property left behind were still eligible to be inherited. Abū Bakr held on to the generality of the statement, and thus, they differed over an issue that was open to interpretation." (5)*

If someone were to say: But the hadith that Abū Bakr used as evidence is not authentic, we would respond to that in the next point, Allah willing.

References:

- (1) See *Zād al-Ma‘ād* (3/291).
- (2) Narrated by al-Bukhārī (3810) and Muslim (1761).
- (3) Narrated by al-Bukhārī (3714, 3767) and Muslim (2449).
- (4) Narrated by al-Bukhārī (3508).
- (5) *Fath al-Bārī* (6/202).

Second Point:

The group argued for the weakness of the hadith by stating that Allah Almighty said:

"{And Solomon inherited David}" [An-Naml: 16],

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

and He also says about **Zakariya** (peace be upon him) that he said:

"**{He will inherit from me, and inherit from the family of Jacob}**" [Maryam: 6].

Thus, they claim that the hadith contradicts the verse, and the verse takes precedence over the hadith.

To respond to this, we say: The matter is not as you claim. What harm would there be if **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) had received her share? Likewise, what harm would there be for **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him) if she had a share?

However, when we refer to the books of exegesis, we find that the stance of the commentators from both the **Ahl as-Sunnah** and the **Shi'a** is almost unanimously agreed upon that the inheritance mentioned in these verses refers to **prophethood, knowledge, and religion**, not the inheritance of land, wealth, or material possessions. **Ibn Kathir** said in his commentary on the verse "**{And Solomon inherited David}**":

"That is, in kingship and prophethood. The inheritance here does not refer to wealth, for if that were the case, Solomon would not have been singled out from among all of David's children, as David had one hundred wives. Rather, what is meant is the inheritance of kingship and prophethood, as the prophets do not leave behind inherited wealth, as the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him) informed us." (1)

Many scholars of **Ahl as-Sunnah** have followed this interpretation (2).

As for the books of the **Shi'a**, **Al-A'qami** states in his interpretation of the verse "**{And Solomon inherited David}**":

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

"That is, his prophethood and knowledge." (3)

And the author of *Tafsir al-Asfa*, **Al-Fayd al-Kashani**, says:

"And Solomon inherited David"—meaning: prophethood." (4)

For further clarification and to affirm the authenticity of the hadith, we will present its acceptance among both **Ahl as-Sunnah** and **Shi'a** in the next aspect.

Third Point:

How can the group claim that the hadith is weak when their own scholars have relied on it and recorded it in their books, even authenticating it? They have verified the hadith:

"Indeed, the scholars are the heirs of the prophets. The prophets do not leave behind dinars or dirhams as inheritance; rather, they leave behind knowledge. Whoever takes it has taken an abundant share." (1)

And this is in addition to its established authenticity among **Ahl as-Sunnah**!

The statement of the Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him):

"We, the community of prophets, do not leave behind inheritance. Whatever we leave behind is charity."

is an authentic hadith, agreed upon by **Ahl as-Sunnah**. It has been narrated from the Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him) by a large number of companions, including: **Abu Bakr** (2),

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

Aisha (3), **Abu Hurairah** (4), **Umar ibn al-Khattab**, **Malik ibn Aws**, **Uthman ibn Affan**, **Abdurrahman ibn Awf**, **Az-Zubayr**, **Sa'd ibn Abi Waqqas**, **Al-Abbas**, **Ali** (5), and others.

Furthermore, the hadith:

"Indeed, the scholars are the heirs of the prophets. The prophets do not leave behind dinars or dirhams as inheritance; rather, they leave behind knowledge. Whoever takes it has taken an abundant share."

is narrated in the **Shi'a** books from **Ja'far as-Sadiq** (may Allah be pleased with him) (6).

However, their scholars ignored it and dismissed it despite its authenticity and verification among them.

Al-Majlisi and **Khomeini** have authenticated it. **Al-Majlisi** states regarding this hadith:

"It has two chains: the first is unknown, and the second is either good or reliable, both of which do not fall short of being authentic." (7)

And **Khomeini** states:

"Ibrahim ibn Hashim is among the leading figures of hadith narrators. All of them are trustworthy, even among those most relied upon in transmitting hadith, let alone being merely trustworthy." (8)

In their book *Al-Kafi*, which they consider one of the most authentic books and claim it is sufficient for the **Shi'a**, **Al-Kulayni** narrates from **Hammad ibn 'Isa**, from **Al-Qaddah**, from **Abu Abdullah** (peace be upon him) that he said:

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

References:

- (1) *Tafsir Ibn Kathir* (6/182).
- (2) See: *Tafsir At-Tabari* (19/437), *Tafsir Ibn Atiyyah* (4/253), *Tafsir Al-Qurtubi* (13/164).
- (3) *Tafsir Al-A'qami* (1/488).
- (4) *Tafsir Al-Asfa* (4/384).
- (5) Narrated by **Al-Bukhari** (3094), **Muslim** (1757).
- (6) See: *Al-Kafi* (1/32-34), *Bihar Al-Anwar* (2/92, 151).
- (7) *Mir'aat Al-Uqool* (1/111), under: *Chapter on the Rewards of Scholars and Students*.
- (8) *Islamic Government* (p. 93), under the title: *Sahih Al-Qaddah*.

The Hadith is authentic according to the Shi'a, and it is clear that the Prophets did not inherit any money, whether little or much, but rather they inherited knowledge. Whoever took from it took a great share. (1)

The Fourth Point:

There is an important matter that those who claim this view must pay attention to, which is that **Umar**, **Uthman**, **Ali**, and **Al-Hasan** (may Allah be pleased with them) took over the caliphate afterward, yet none of them gave anything to the heirs of **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her).

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fatimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

If there were a right for her, it would not be nullified by the passing of years (2), and this responds to those who claim the hadith is weak.

At this point, it is worth asking the Rafidah: Did **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) return this inheritance to her heirs when he took over the caliphate? The answer is: no.

If we say about **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) what we say about **Abu Bakr** and **Umar**, since neither of them gave **Fatimah** her rightful share from her father's inheritance, then if someone were to say, "**Fatimah** had passed away by then," we would respond: Even though **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) had passed away, if she had a right to inherit from her father, it would belong to her heirs after her. So, why did **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) not distribute it when he assumed the caliphate and took charge? Why didn't he distribute it when it was entrusted to him? Why didn't **Al-Hasan** take his inheritance when he became in charge? (3).

Thus, it becomes clear that many of the Companions, even the ones closest to **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her), did not see **Fadak** as belonging to her right, but they followed the view of **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him). Similarly, the followers (tabi'un) also held the same view as **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him) on this matter. This is the next response we offer.

The Fifth Point:

It is confirmed from **Umar bin Abd al-Aziz** that he testified that **Fadak** does not belong to **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her):

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fatimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

When **Umar bin Abd al-Aziz** was appointed caliph, he gathered the Banu **Marwan** and said:

*"The Messenger of Allah ﷺ had **Fadak**, and he used to spend from it, and he would support the young of Banu **Hashim** from it and marry off their widows. And **Fatimah** asked **Abu Bakr** to give it to her, but he refused. It remained that way in the life of the Messenger of Allah ﷺ until he passed away. Then, when **Abu Bakr** took over, he dealt with it in the same way that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ had during his life until he passed away. When **Umar bin al-Khattab** took over, he did the same as they had done until he passed away. Then, **Marwan** took it, and it passed to **Umar bin Abd al-Aziz**. I saw that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ prevented **Fatimah** from it, and I have no right to it. And I hereby testify that I have returned it to what it was" (1), meaning: during the time of the Messenger of Allah ﷺ, **Abu Bakr**, and **Umar**.

The Sixth Point:

According to the Shi'a doctrine, women do not inherit anything from real estate or land by consensus. So, how could **Fatimah** ask for **Fadak** according to their belief?

Independent chapters have been devoted to this subject in Shi'a books. **Al-Kulayni** titled a chapter under "*Women do not inherit anything from real estate*", and under it, he narrated many traditions, including:

Imam Abu Ja'far, the fourth infallible Imam according to them, said:

"*Women do not inherit anything from the land or real estate*" (2).

Al-Saduq Ibn Babawayh al-Qummi in *Man La Yahduruhu al-Faqih* narrated from **Imam Abu Abdullah Ja'far**, the fifth infallible Imam according to them, that **Umm Maysarah** asked him

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the

Land of **Fadak**

about what women inherit. He replied:

"As for land and real estate, they do not inherit anything from them" (3).

And there are many such narrations, and they mentioned the agreement of their scholars on the issue of women not inheriting real estate or land (4). Since women do not inherit real estate or land, how could **Fatimah** ask for **Fadak** according to their view? (5).

The Seventh Point:

They say: *"And Fatimah (may Allah be pleased with her) became upset with him over this and abandoned him, and she did not speak to him until she passed away."* (6)

References:

(1) Narrated by **Abu Dawood**, Hadith 2972.

(2) *Al-Furu' min al-Kafi*, Book of Inheritance (7/137).

(3) *Al-Furu' min al-Kafi*, Book of Fara'id and Inheritance (4/347).

(4) See: *Ghayat al-Mirad* (3/583).

(5) See: *Shi'a and Ahl al-Bayt*, p. 84.

(6) Narrated by **Al-Bukhari** (4240, 4241), and **Muslim** (1759).

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

This statement is not to be taken at face value. The meaning here is that she, may Allah be pleased with her, did not speak to him about the inheritance until she passed away. It is not as some people claim by saying that she did not speak to **Abu Bakr** at all until she died.

Al-Qurtubi (may Allah have mercy on him) explained this by saying: "Then she did not meet **Abu Bakr** due to her preoccupation with her grief over the death of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him), and because she stayed in her house. The narrator expressed this as estrangement, but in reality, it is not permissible for a Muslim to abandon his brother for more than three days, as the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him) said."

(Narrated by **Bukhari** 6237, **Muslim** 2560). She was the most knowledgeable of people regarding what is permissible and impermissible in such matters, and the furthest from contradicting the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him). How could she have acted otherwise, she being the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him) and the leader of the women of Paradise? (**Al-Mufhim**, 3/568-569).

This cannot be imagined in the case of **Al-Zahra** (may Allah be pleased with her). The truth, which is evident from both Sunni and Shia books, is that **Abu Bakr** acted according to the Hadith of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him). He went to **Fatima** (may Allah be pleased with her), sought her permission, and she was pleased with him. **Al-Sha'bi** narrated that when **Fatima** fell ill, **Abu Bakr** came and asked for permission to enter. **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) said: "O **Fatima**, **Abu Bakr** is asking to enter. Do you wish to allow him?" She replied, "Do you want me to allow him?" He said: "Yes." She then allowed him to enter, and he came in to make peace with her, saying: "By Allah, I did not leave my house, my wealth, my family, and my tribe except seeking the pleasure of Allah, His Messenger, and the

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

pleasure of you, the People of the House." Then he reconciled with her until she was pleased.

(Narrated by **Al-Bayhaqi** in **Al-Kubra**, 6/301, and **Ibn Kathir** in **Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya**, 5/252).

Even if the intention was that she did not speak to him at all until she passed away, this—according to the knowledge of the narrator in this Hadith, and in the narration of **Al-Sha'bi**—adds to our knowledge, confirming that **Abu Bakr** visited her, spoke to her, and was reconciled with her. The narrator of the negation (estrangement) is contradicted by the narration of **Al-Sha'bi**, who affirms the visit and reconciliation. It is well-known among scholars that the affirmation of a matter takes precedence over its denial, because the possibility of affirmation occurs without the knowledge of the one who denies, especially in such matters. The visit of **Abu Bakr** to **Fatima** (may Allah be pleased with her) was not a major event that would have been widely known; rather, it was a regular matter, which would not be highlighted unless it was necessary. This is why such things might have been overlooked by those who did not witness them.

What is surprising is that the books of the people themselves confirm **Fatima's** (may Allah be pleased with her) satisfaction with **Abu Bakr** and his family, as we will see in the next point.

Eighth Point: The Shia Narrations Themselves Confirm Fatima's Satisfaction with Abu Bakr's Rule

Some Shia narrations confirm that **Fatima** (may Allah be pleased with her) was content with **Abu Bakr's** decision. **Al-Kamal al-Din**, by **Mitham ibn Ali al-Bahrani**, a Shia scholar, narrates: "Then **Abu Bakr** said to her: 'You have what your father had. The Messenger of Allah

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fātimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the

Land of **Fadak**

(peace and blessings be upon him) used to take from Fadak to provide for you, and he would distribute the rest and use it in the way of Allah. You have a right from Allah that I act with it as your father used to do.' **Fatima** was satisfied with this and took an oath from him." (Shia and Ahl al-Bayt, p. 84). A similar narration is mentioned by **Al-Danbali** in his explanation of the **Al-Durra al-Najfiya** (p. 331-332).

Even more than that: the leaders of the Shia themselves report that **Abu Bakr** did not limit his actions to mere words; he followed up with actions. According to **Ibn al-Mitham**, **Al-Danbali**, **Ibn Abi al-Hadid**, and the contemporary Shia scholar **Faydh al-Islam Ali Taqi**, **Abu Bakr** used to take the revenues of Fadak and give to the family of the Prophet (the People of the House) what was sufficient for them, and distribute the remainder. This was also the practice of **Umar**, then **Uthman**, and then **Ali**. (Shia and Ahl al-Bayt, p. 84).

Ninth Point: Fatima's Relationship with the Family of Abu Bakr Supports This Claim

Fatima (may Allah be pleased with her) ordered that she be washed by **Abu Bakr**'s wife, **Asma bint Umais**, who later married **Ali ibn Abi Talib** (may Allah be pleased with him). She also instructed that she be buried in a place where no strange men could see her, out of her great modesty. **Asma** carried out her instructions. (Al-Nasr al-Sahih wa al-Al, p. 10; Sharh Nahj al-Balagha, 5/107; Al-Durra al-Najfiya, p. 332).

References:

1. **Bukhari**, Hadith 6237

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

2. *Muslim*, Hadith 2560
3. *Al-Mufhim*, 3/568-569
4. *Al-Bayhaqi in Al-Kubra*, 6/301
5. *Ibn Kathir, Al-Bidaya wa'l-Nihaya*, 5/252
6. *Al-Kamal al-Din*, p. 84
7. *Al-Danbali, Al-Durra al-Najfiya*, p. 331-332
8. *Shia and Ahl al-Bayt*, p. 84
9. *Al-Nasr al-Sahih wa al-Al*, p. 10
10. *Sharh Nahj al-Balaghah*, 5/107
11. *Al-Durra al-Najfiya*, p. 332

Bint Amis (the wife of **Abu Bakr**) attended to her care and participated in washing her, then buried her. It is not possible for her to have cared for and washed **Fāṭima** except with the permission and knowledge of her husband **Abu Bakr**. This indicates the affection and love between them. If **Abu Bakr** had not honored **Fāṭima**, he would not have permitted his wife to care for her, wash her, and shroud her. How then, after this affectionate relationship, can some people claim that **Abu Bakr** wronged **Fāṭima**? This did not happen, and their own books confirm this, as seen in the following point.

The Tenth Point: Shī‘ah Narrations Themselves Prove that Abu Bakr Did Not Wrong Fāṭima:

Because of this, when **Abu Ja'far Muhammad al-Bāqir** was asked about this, and **Kathīr al-Nawāl** asked him: "May I be sacrificed for you, did **Abu Bakr** and **‘Umar** wrong you in any of your rights? Or did they take anything from your rights?" He said: "No, by the One who sent

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

down the Qur'ān upon His servant to be a warner to the worlds, they did not wrong us in the slightest, not even the weight of a mustard seed." I said: "May I be sacrificed for you, should I apologize to them?" He said: "Yes, woe to you! Apologize to them in this world and the Hereafter, and whatever has happened to you is on my neck."

Zayd ibn Ali ibn Husayn, the brother of **al-Bāqir**, also said regarding **Fadak** what his grandfather **'Ali ibn Abi Tālib** and his brother **Muhammad al-Bāqir** had said when **Buhtari ibn Hasan** asked him: "I said to **Zayd ibn Ali** peace be upon him while I wanted to clear up the matter of **Abu Bakr**: 'Verily **Abu Bakr** took **Fadak** from **Fāṭima** (peace be upon her).' He said: 'Verily **Abu Bakr** was a compassionate man, and he disliked changing anything that the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) had done.' Then **Zayd** said: 'By Allah, if the matter had returned to me, I would have ruled in the same manner as **Abu Bakr** did.'" So, after this, does the matter require more clarification?

The Eleventh Point: There Is a Claim Amongst the People That They Compare Abu Bakr's Treatment of Jābir with Fāṭima's:

Some say: Why did **Abu Bakr** believe **Jābir** when he spoke, but did not believe **Fāṭima**? The answer is that once the context of the speech is understood, the confusion vanishes for anyone fair-minded. Every person of understanding distinguishes between a promise and a claim. To further explain this, we say: **Jābir ibn 'Abd Allāh** came to inform that the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) had promised him a certain thing. Out of loyalty to the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him), **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him) fulfilled the promise made to **Jābir**.

Muhammad ibn 'Ali narrated from **Jābir**, and from **Ibn al-Munkadir** from **Jābir**, and from

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the

Land of **Fadak**

al-Shu‘bī from **Jābir**, who said: "The Prophet (peace be upon him) said to me: 'When a large amount of wealth comes to me, I will give it to you in this way.' Then the Prophet (peace be upon him) passed away before giving it to me. So when **Abu Bakr** became the successor, wealth came from **al-Bahrayn**, and he said: 'Take it as the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) promised you.'"

As for **Fāṭima**, she did not say: "The Messenger of Allah promised me," but rather she claimed her right from the inheritance of her father. She understood that she had the right to inherit from her father, and she did not say: "My father promised me."

Thus, **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him) did not deny **Fāṭima**, but rather made it clear to her that what the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) left was charity, as explicitly stated by the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him).

This is supported by what was narrated by **al-Tirmidhī** from **Abū Hurayrah**, who said:

"**Fāṭima** came to **Abu Bakr** and said: 'Who will inherit from you?' He said: 'My family and children.' She said: 'Why do I not inherit from my father?' **Abu Bakr** said: 'I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) say: "We, the family of the Prophets, do not leave inheritance. What we leave is charity."'"

References:

1. *Al-Majlisi, Bihār al-Anwār*, 30/347-348: "It is narrated that when her death approached, she said to **Asma' bint 'Amīr**: 'When I die, look to the house...'. He then mentioned those who were present at her death, saying: 'No one was present except **Amīr**

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

al-Mu'minīn (Ali), al-Hasan, al-Husayn, Zaynab, Umm Kulthūm, Fidda (her maid), and Asma' bint 'Amīs."

2. *Al-Āmālī* by *al-Mufīd*, p. 281: "He used to care for her himself, and he was assisted in that by *Asma' bint 'Amīs*."
3. *Al-Āmālī* by *al-Tūsī*, p. 109, *Kashf al-Ghummah*, 2/122-126.
4. *Al-Uṣūl min al-Kāfi*, *Kitāb al-Hujjah*, *Bāb al-Fayy' wal-Anfāl*, 1/539.
5. *Musnad al-Bazzār*, 1/179, *Hadīth* no. 98: "When **Jābir** spoke, **Abu Bakr** believed him, and the narration from **Jābir** was a virtue for **Abu Bakr**, because he fulfilled what was mentioned by **Jābir** that the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) had promised him."
6. *al-Tirmidhī*, narrated by *Abū Hurayrah*: "**Fāṭima** came to **Abu Bakr** and said: 'Who will inherit from you?' He said: 'My family and children.' She said: 'Why do I not inherit from my father?' **Abu Bakr** said: 'I heard the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) say: "We, the family of the Prophets, do not leave inheritance. What we leave is charity."'"

"The Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) said: 'We do not leave an inheritance, but we provide for those whom the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) used to provide for and support.'"

The Twelfth Point:

There is something worth mentioning in our response to the people: If anyone were to inherit

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fatimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the

Land of **Fadak**

from the Prophet (peace be upon him), it would be his wives and his uncle **Abu Talib** (may Allah be pleased with them). All of these individuals did not receive anything. So why was the issue limited to **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her)? Why did the others not demand their inheritance if what they mention regarding the issue of Fadak is correct?

If the land of Fadak were the inheritance of the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him), **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) would not have been the only one to inherit it. **Abu Bakr** and **Umar** (may Allah be pleased with them) would also have been inheritors. **Abu Bakr** and **Umar** prevented their daughters from inheriting, just as **Fatimah** was prevented.

Furthermore, **Abu Talib**, the uncle of the Prophet (peace be upon him), was alive and certainly would have inherited. So this is not an issue particular to **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her). Where is **Abu Talib**? Why did he not come and claim his inheritance from the Prophet (peace be upon him)? And where are the wives of the Prophet (peace be upon him), such as **Aisha**, the daughter of **Abu Bakr**? They did not come and demand their inheritance from the Prophet (peace be upon him).

The Thirteenth Point:

The people used the hadith about **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her), where the Prophet (peace be upon him) said: "*Fatimah is a part of me. Whoever makes her angry, makes me angry.*" They claim that **Abu Bakr** angered **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her), thus he is included in this hadith.

The response to this is as follows:

First: The caliphs after **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him) acted in the same way,

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fatimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

meaning that he was in the right. Therefore, the anger that would anger **Fatimah**, and for which the Prophet (peace be upon him) would be angered, is when it is justified, i.e., when she was right. And **Fatimah** is the leader of the women of the worlds, and she, like all the daughters of **Adam**, has the right to get angry. The Prophet (peace be upon him) said about himself: "*I am only a human being, so if I am cursed or spoken ill of, let it be an atonement for me and a reward.*"

Second: **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) once angered **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her). So can it be said that **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) angered **Fatimah**, and then she became angry with him, or that he quarreled with her and left her, and that his action angered the Prophet (peace be upon him)?

Third: **Abu Bakr** (may Allah be pleased with him) knew the rights of the family of the Prophet (peace be upon him), and it did not please him that **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) died angry with him. Therefore, he sought her approval before her death and she was pleased with him.

The Fourteenth Argument:

The claim that **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) was wronged, beaten, and had her rib broken:

First: This claim has not been proven with a reliable chain of narration. All the chains of narrations for this incident are fabricated. Whoever has a valid proof should present it.

Second: Any reasonable person knows that these narrations contradict what is known about the bravery of **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him). If these events were true, where is **Ali**? Where is

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fatimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the

Land of **Fadak**

his defense of the daughter of the Prophet (peace be upon him)?

Third: The pre-Islamic Arabs were known for their jealousy, and they would not have tolerated such an act. So how could it be that Islam, which commanded the defense of wealth, and made the one who is killed defending his wealth a martyr, would allow this act against **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her)? How could she be beaten, her rib broken, and her child miscarried while **Ali** (may Allah be pleased with him) remained silent?

Fourth: Even the Shia scholars themselves have rejected this story. Some contemporary Shia scholars, such as **Sayed Muhammad Hussain Fadlallah**, have distanced themselves from this topic, both from a transmission and rational perspective. He said: "I never said that the rib of **Fatimah** (may Allah be pleased with her) was broken, and anyone who attributes that to me is lying. I dismissed the topic entirely and raised a question mark based on historical analysis. I did not engage with it because the love of the Muslims for **Fatimah** was greater than their love for **Ali**, and greater than their love for **Al-Hasan**."

References:

1. **Sunan al-Tirmidhi**, Hadith 1608, classified as "Hasan Gharib" from this narration.
2. **Sahih al-Bukhari**, Hadith 1816.
3. **Sahih Muslim**, Hadith 8/24.
4. **Sahih al-Bukhari**, Hadith 8/77.
5. **Sunan al-Kubra** by **Al-Bayhaqi**, Volume 6, Page 301.

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the Land of **Fadak**

6. **Sahih al-Bukhari**, Hadith 2348, and **Sahih Muslim**, Hadith 141, also mentioned in **Al-Kafi**, Vol. 5, Pages 52, 296, and **Man La Yahduruḥu al-Faqih**, Vol. 4, Page 96.

And Hussein, and above that their love for the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him), I said: It is highly unlikely that anyone would dare do such a thing.

Fifthly: The status of Fatimah (may Allah be pleased with her) among the Companions (may Allah be pleased with them) contradicts such a claim. The Companions could not have remained silent if anything like that had occurred, especially given their immense love for her and her father (peace be upon him). It becomes clear that this story is a product of imagination and pure slander. Its falsehood is evident in Islamic law, reason, and reality. However, it is merely a tool to stir up hatred and enmity among Muslims, sowing division and distracting them from seeking the truth by stirring up emotions over matters that lead to no benefit. And Allah is the one from whom we seek help.

All that has been said or narrated under the title of the oppression of Fatimah (may Allah be pleased with her) is fabricated and has no basis in truth.

Endnote:

May Allah guide our friends, loved ones, family, and all believers to the truth and righteousness. We ask Allah to safeguard us from the deceptions, lies, and tricks of any falsehood, particularly those stemming from misguided ideologies. May He protect our hearts, our minds, and our faith from anything that leads us away from the straight path. May we be shielded by His mercy, and

The Doubt Regarding the Inheritance of **Fāṭimah**, May Allah Be Pleased with Her, from the
Land of **Fadak**

may He grant us the strength to always seek the truth, protect our faith, and be firm upon the teachings of the Prophet (peace be upon him) and the righteous companions. Ameen.

All praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the worlds